GOOD CAREER GUIDANCE

SIR JOHN HOLMAN
Good career guidance helps inspire students towards further study and enables them to make informed decisions whenever choices are open to them. It helps them to understand enough about the world of work to know what skills they need to succeed. It is important for social mobility because it helps open students’ eyes to careers they may not have considered. Ofsted now includes career guidance specifically within the inspection framework.

Career guidance in the UK has been much criticised, but what would it look like were it good? Our team visited six countries (the Netherlands, Germany, Hong Kong, Finland, Canada and Ireland) where both career guidance and educational results are good. We also visited schools in England and studied the available literature on career guidance in English state schools. From all this input we made a judgement on what ‘good’ looks like in the form of eight benchmarks identifying different dimensions of good career guidance.

### THE BENCHMARKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benchmark</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td><strong>A STABLE CAREERS PROGRAMME</strong> Every school and college should have an embedded programme of career education and guidance that is known and understood by students, parents, teachers, governors and employers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>LEARNING FROM CAREER AND LABOUR MARKET INFORMATION</strong> Every student, and their parents, should have access to good quality information about future study options and labour market opportunities. They will need the support of an informed adviser to make best use of available information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><strong>ADDRESSING THE NEEDS OF EACH STUDENT</strong> Students have different career guidance needs at different stages. Opportunities for advice and support need to be tailored to the needs of each student. A school’s careers programme should embed equality and diversity considerations throughout.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><strong>LINKING CURRICULUM LEARNING TO CAREERS</strong> All teachers should link curriculum learning with careers. STEM subject teachers should highlight the relevance of STEM subjects for a wide range of future career paths.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><strong>ENCOUNTERS WITH EMPLOYERS AND EMPLOYEES</strong> Every student should have multiple opportunities to learn from employers about work, employment and the skills that are valued in the workplace. This can be through a range of enrichment activities including visiting speakers, mentoring and enterprise schemes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td><strong>EXPERIENCES OF WORKPLACES</strong> Every student should have first-hand experiences of the workplace through work visits, work shadowing and/or work experience to help their exploration of career opportunities, and expand their networks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td><strong>ENCOUNTERS WITH FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION</strong> All students should understand the full range of learning opportunities that are available to them. This includes both academic and vocational routes and learning in schools, colleges, universities and in the workplace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td><strong>PERSONAL GUIDANCE</strong> Every student should have opportunities for guidance interviews with a career adviser, who could be internal (a member of school staff) or external, provided they are trained to an appropriate level. These should be available whenever significant study or career choices are being made. They should be expected for all students but should be timed to meet their individual needs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NEXT STEPS**

Since the publication in 2014 of these eight benchmarks for good career guidance, considerable momentum has built around their use and application. Organisations and agencies that have used the benchmarks in their own work include:

- The Career and Enterprise Company
- Teach First
- Sutton Trust
- Individual schools
- Academy Trusts
- Local authorities

In order for us to rigorously test the eight benchmarks, identify any barriers and look at how they can be overcome, as well as generate case studies, we have undertaken a pilot in partnership with the North East Local Enterprise Partnership (North East LEP), which includes 13 schools and three colleges, who are actively testing the implementation of the benchmarks.

With the support of a modest development fund, schools and colleges in the pilot are being encouraged to work in partnership to explore new approaches to achieving the benchmarks. They are tackling ways to use LMI data, collect destination data and make best use of their governing body. If young people know more about the range of careers open to people with the right qualifications, they will have a clearer idea of the routes to better jobs.
In order for us to get an idea of how English schools measure up against the benchmarks and to understand how close to these standards they currently were, we surveyed a representative sample of schools.

Schools taking part were spread across all regions of the country and included a range of types.

Fulfilling all the components of all the benchmarks is ambitious. The graph below shows that 69 per cent of schools achieved at least one benchmark and 39 per cent achieved at least two.

However, only two per cent of schools achieved five of the eight benchmarks, and no schools achieved six or more benchmarks.

The survey revealed that schools see the importance of providing career guidance. Many schools are partially fulfilling the benchmarks, for example experiences are only offered to some pupils. Reaching the standard of the benchmarks is potentially within the grasp of all schools.

DIFFERENCES BETWEEN SCHOOLS

School leaders were asked to judge the importance of their careers programme to their school culture and ethos:

89% of them found their careers programme to be either very or quite important

88% did not want to lose any of their current provision, but rather wanted to increase and extend it

From the survey evidence, schools see the importance of providing career guidance for their pupils and recognise the value of providing a range of different experiences.

Schools graded by Ofsted as ‘Outstanding’ are significantly more likely than those graded as either ‘Good’ or ‘Requiring improvement’ to:

– Have a structured careers programme that is written down;
– Evaluate the effectiveness of their careers plan every three years;
– Secure systematic feedback from pupils, parents and employers every three years;
– Have a particular individual with responsibility for careers work and advice;
– Keep systematic records of individual advice;
– Say that all pupils have had at least one direct experience of a workplace;
– Rate the careers programme as being ‘very important’ for pupils.

It is important to note that whilst many English schools and colleges have some way to go before they would achieve all of the benchmarks, none of the overseas schools that we visited, even the most exemplary, would have achieved all the benchmarks.

Most of the benchmarks have several components, and achieving all of them is an ambitious challenge for even the best schools.
ADOPTING THE BENCHMARKS WOULD OBVIOUSLY HAVE A COST, BUT AGAINST THIS ARE THE ECONOMIC BENEFITS THAT FOLLOW

We commissioned PwC to estimate the costs of implementing each benchmark and to estimate their economic benefits. We anticipate that schools will work towards all eight benchmarks simultaneously, but PwC estimated the cost of activities required to achieve each benchmark separately.

The cost of implementing all the benchmarks in a medium-sized school outside London is estimated at £53,637 in the first year, and £44,676 in subsequent years. This is equivalent to £54 per student from the second year onwards, and is less than 1% of the school's budget.

PwC’s review suggests that economic and social outcomes are likely to arise from a sequence of links. This impact pathway is set out in Figure 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Inner London</th>
<th>Outer London</th>
<th>The Fringe Area</th>
<th>Rest of England</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Small</td>
<td>£48,264</td>
<td>£46,942</td>
<td>£40,608</td>
<td>£38,472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>£56,874</td>
<td>£55,380</td>
<td>£47,053</td>
<td>£44,676</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large</td>
<td>£77,445</td>
<td>£75,649</td>
<td>£62,184</td>
<td>£59,161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixth Form</td>
<td>£76,744</td>
<td>£74,978</td>
<td>£61,784</td>
<td>£58,708</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2: Sensitivity analysis: Total cost of achieving the benchmarks by school type and location from the second year onwards

THE BENEFITS AND COSTS

PwC gleaned some sense of the scale of the potential economic and social benefits of the career guidance benchmarks relative to their costs of delivery. They compared the lifetime cost of providing one pupil with career guidance throughout their school career with the estimated total return (i.e. increased lifetime earnings for the individual, enhanced income tax and National Insurance receipts to the Exchequer and potential cost savings for public finances in areas such as benefits, crime, healthcare etc.)

On the basis that the expected lifetime cost is approximately £200, then if:

– One more pupil is encouraged to attain an undergraduate degree (when otherwise they would only have acquired A levels), this would be enough to offset the costs of providing the benchmarks to 985 pupils;
– One more female pupil is encouraged to attain a foundation degree (when otherwise they would only have acquired A levels), this would be enough to offset the costs of providing the benchmarks to 535 pupils;
– One more pupil is encouraged to attain a Level 3 apprenticeship (when otherwise they would only have acquired a Level 2 qualification), this would be enough to offset the costs of providing the benchmarks to between 665 and 990 pupils;
– One more pupil is deterred or prevented from becoming NEET, the avoided cost to the Exchequer would be enough to provide the benchmarks to 280 pupils.

PwC estimate that the total cost of achieving all the benchmarks in a typical school will be equivalent to £54 per pupil per year or less than 1% of the school's budget.
For more information on the benchmarks and further recommendations for their implementation, please visit gatsby.org.uk/goodcareerguidance